

LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

November 23, 2021

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Michele Derr
Christy Graham
Joel Hartmangruber
Andy Lee
Nadine McKown
Janel Ponder Smith
Marcela Medellin
Tim Brewer

■ Chairperson
■ Member
■ Member
■ Member
■ Vice-Chairperson
■ Member
■ Member
■ Council Liaison

Terry Floyd, Development Services Director
Karen Gagné, Planning Administrator
Amy Gardner, Legal Department

■ City Staff
■ City Staff
■ City Staff

ABSENT:

John Dickinson
Noros Martin

■ Member
■ P&Z Liaison

GUESTS:

Jorge Ramirez, 2914 10th Street
Edgar Ramirez, 2914 10th Street
Randolph Umlah, 1308 Grant
Ben Hoover, 711 Indiana Avenue
Grant Rogers, 711 Indiana Avenue

■ Contractor
■ Contractor
■ Applicant
■ Applicant
■ Applicant

I. Call to Order, Welcome and Introductions

Chairperson Michele Derr called the meeting to order at 12:00 p.m. Ms. Derr had Commission members, staff and guests, introduce themselves.

II. Review & Approval of Minutes from: October 26th 2021

Chairperson Michele Derr called for review and approval of the October 26th 2021 Landmark Commission meeting minutes. Ms. Janel Ponder-Smith made a motion to approve the minutes, Mr. Andy Lee seconded the motion. Minutes were unanimously approved.

III. Unfinished Business & General Orders: – 2914 10th Street (*West Floral Heights Historic District*)

- Request authorization to remove and replace wood siding with James Hardie Board siding (West Floral Heights HD)

Chairperson Michele Derr introduced Agenda Item III as first order of business, the unfinished business of motion relating to design review for 2914 10th Street.

Ms. Janel Ponder-Smith introduced a motion to withdraw the design review case for 2914 10th Street from October 2021 to postpone the case until the next meeting that requested

authorization to remove and replace wood siding with James Hardie Board siding. Ms. Nadine McKown seconded the motion to withdraw. Motion officially withdrawn with unanimous approval.

IV. Action Item: Design Review – 2914 10th Street (West Floral Heights Historic District)

- Request a major house renovation/repair project including: replace wood siding and asbestos shingle siding; new gable fascia board; construct a 10x12ft addition; remove & replace two windows (addition); add gutters/downspouts; wood privacy fence placed above existing stone fence line; replace driveway; iron gate across driveway; lighting/security cameras. (*Residential*)

Ms. Karen Gagné presented the case and stated staff received a revised application from the contractor and home owner. The property is located at the corner of Hayes and 10th Street and is a key entry point into the West Floral Heights Historic District neighborhood. Ms. Gagné advised the home was a 1 ½ story craftsman style, built in 1928 with key features being side gable roof and porch.

Ms. Christy Graham introduced a motion to hear each design review item and vote on each one individually. Ms. Janel Ponder-Smith seconded the motion to vote on individual review items. Motion unanimously approved.

1. *Replace Original Wood Siding*: west, north and east facades; propose to utilize wooden curved, edge panels with the same profile as original (2-inch overlap and 6 inch siding). Project will involve removal of original wooden siding, wrapping the house, installing a vapor barrier, then insulation and new wooden panel siding that will be treated and painted.

Ms. Graham introduced a motion to authorize replacement of the original wood siding at 2914 10th Street based on CWF Design Guidelines Sec. 4 – Sequence of Appropriate Treatment Options (b) and Exterior Walls/Murals item (d) and utilizing new wood siding with the same size, width and profile. Ms. Ponder-Smith seconded the motion; passed unanimously.

2. *Asbestos Shingle Siding* - cover the existing asbestos shingle siding (east and west gable end walls) with fiber cement board textured shingles to replicate the same size/shape. Sample was present by the applicant at the meeting.

Ms. Ponder-Smith introduced a motion to accept the use of Weather Side Purity Wavy 12 in x 24 in fiber-cement siding shingles to cover existing asbestos shingle siding only on the gable end walls based on CWF Design Guidelines Sec. 4 – Exterior Walls/Murals item (d); replacement shingle siding has same texture, profile and wavy exposed edge. Motion seconded by Ms. Graham; passed unanimously.

3. *Replace Dormer Fascia/Rake Board* - request to replace rotting wood board with wood on 10th St facade for roof dormer.

Ms. Ponder-Smith motioned to allow replacement of the rotting wood fascia/rake board with same wood materials based on CWF Design Guidelines Sec. 4 –

Sequence of Appropriate Treatment Options (3.b) and Sec. 4 – Exterior Walls/Murals item (c and d). Mr. Hartmangruber seconded; passed unanimously.

4. *Rear Addition – request a 10 x 12 ft. addition (120 sq. ft.) on the northeast corner of house to provide for a utility/laundry room. Floor plan enclosed with application.*

After lengthy discussion and questions among Commission members and the contractor, including concerns about the roof line and if it would be altered. The contractor indicated the utility room addition would have an interior step down so the walls & ceiling would be adjusted to ensure the same roof slope continued to the addition and keep the exposed rafters. Ms. Graham introduced a motion to authorize the construction of a rear, northeast corner addition of 10ft x 12ft utilizing the same approved, exterior materials for the wood siding, exposed rafters, and roof. Motion based on CWF Design Guidelines Sec. 4 – Sequence of Appropriate Treatment Options (3.d) and Sec. C. Additions to Contributing Buildings (2. – locate additions as inconspicuously as possible. Consider the effect that the addition will have on the existing and neighboring buildings; 2.b) and (3.b) Mr. Hartmangruber seconded the motion; passed unanimously.

5. *Remove/Replace Windows - related to the addition; will remove 2 existing windows on rear facade; will include two windows in addition - 1 on east facade and 1 on rear (north facade) with same profile (6 over 6). Replacement windows will be aluminum frame to comply with design standards. Size of windows to be determined by Landmark and Building code requirements.*

Item generated significant discussion, particularly related to the removal component and size of replacement windows. Ms. Graham introduced a motion to allow removal of a rear east window (6 over 6) and a small rear entry window (2 over 2) to accommodate the rear addition with the requirement that there be two windows in the addition (east and north facades) with the same size/profile of 6 over 6 as the other windows on the east façade and matching wood trim. Windows cannot be vinyl; approved materials are either wood or aluminum clad wood windows. Motion based on CWF Design Guidelines Sec. 4 – Sequence of Appropriate Treatment Options (3.d) and Sec. C. Additions to Contributing Buildings and Sec. 4, Item 6. Windows and Screens; (e. and h.). Ms. Ponder-Smith seconded the motion; passed unanimously.

6. *Gutters/Downspouts - request for installation on the north and south facades to direct water away from the structure and foundation. Exposed rafters will remain unchanged.*

Discussion and clarification provided regarding how the gutters would be attached to the structure and it will be via the rafters. Concern expressed regarding the south façade (10th St) as there is fascia board; was the fascia board added or original or if it should be the exposed rafters as on the rear, north façade. It was surmised that fascia board may not have been installed on the rear rafters or was previously removed as it appears on three facades of the structure. Ms. Graham introduced a motion to authorize placement of gutters/downspout system on the north and south facades to attach to the fascia boards but ensure the feature of exposed rafters' remains; if fascia board needs to be installed it can be as part of the project. Motion

based on CWF Design Guidelines Sec. 4 – Sequence of Appropriate Treatment Options (3.c. d). Ms. Ponder-Smith seconded the motion; passed unanimously.

7. *Fence Extension* - request approval to install a tapered wooden privacy fence above the historic stone fencing along Hayes Street and rear alley. Propose to install fencing posts in ground immediately adjacent to stone fence line in order to not disturb stonework and have wooden fence attached only to support posts. Along Hayes Street fence will be approximately 6ft total height and angle toward the rear line for an 8 ft. fence along the alley. Additional fencing requested for security and privacy.

Ms. McKown introduced a motion to approve installation of a fence extension consisting of wood panels attached to support poles. The support poles will not be attached to the stone fence sections but anchored directly in the ground. Motion based on CWF Design Guidelines Sec. 3 – Architectural Character of Wichita Falls: Architectural Styles – Fences; and Sec. 4 (11.g) – Landscape and Streetscape Features. Ms. Ponder-Smith seconded the motion; passed unanimously.

8. *Driveway* - east side of property; request removal of existing broken concrete and replace with new concrete driveway stamped to match pattern of the redesigned section of 10th Street.

Ms. Ponder-Smith motioned to approve removal and replacement of the concrete driveway with stamped & stained concrete. Motion based on CWF Design Guidelines Sec. 3 – Architectural Character of Wichita Falls: Architectural Styles – Driveways. Ms. McKown seconded the motion; passed unanimously.

9. *Iron Gate* - request an iron gate be installed across the driveway for security; final style will either be double or single gate that compliments Craftsman architecture.

Ms. Graham motioned to accept the proposal to install an iron gate access across the rear portion of the driveway similar in design to the versions presented to the Commission and examples in the National Register of Historic Places – Morningside District. Motion based on CWF Design Guidelines Sec. 3 – Architectural Character of Wichita Falls: Architectural Styles. Ms. Ponder-Smith seconded the motion; passed unanimously.

10. *Lighting/Security Cameras* - request exterior lighting (motion sensor spotlights – north façade example) on each facade and security cameras on the corners of the structure.

Discussion among members and contractor regarding style of security lighting, glare to adjacent neighbors and details from contractor. Contractor indicated lights proposed for installation would consist of two-spotlights and a center camera similar to what exists on the north façade (rear entry). It was noted yard lighting has been an issue within the West Floral Heights Historic District and owner/contractor were urged to take into consideration placement, angle of lighting, height and impacts so it doesn't result in direct glare into neighbor's yards and homes. Ms. Ponder Smith introduced a motion to allow installation of spotlights with combination security

camera on the facades of the structure. Motion was seconded by Ms. Graham; passed unanimously.

V. Action Item: Design Review – 1308 Grant Street (West Floral Heights HD)

- Request to repair/retrofit brick columns/wall of porte-cochere with salvaged and new brick

Ms. Karen Gagné presented the case and stated the subject property was located in the middle of the 1300 block of Grant Street. The home is Craftsman style architecture, built in 1925 and is contributing to the West Floral Heights Historic District. The typical architectural features include low-pitched, cross-gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang, exposed roof rafters and beams under gables. A full-width porch with front gable roof supported by tapered, square columns atop square brick piers. Front gabled porte-cochere at left side, wood clapboard siding and asymmetrical façade, with entry feature stained-glass sidelights.

Ms. Gagné advised the owner is requesting repair and retrofit since some bricks are damaged beyond reuse. This project is important as long-term maintenance to avoid damage to entire porte-cochere and structure. The owner authorized property access to obtain detailed photos illustrating the deteriorating condition of porte-cochere columns and wall. Photos of porte-cochere's columns and wall show significant shifting and damage due to age, ground shifting and potential water/tree root damage. Owner requesting to repair damage; contractor estimates ability to retain approximately 75% of existing bricks and supplement with new bricks.

Commission member asked if brick was to be removed and cleaned and then rebuilt. Owner advised yes, with steel post inside to help with stability in the future, using as many of the original bricks as possible. If foundation is found to be unstable all brick will be removed, foundation repaired and brick put back to match original footprint.

Ms. Christy Graham introduced the motion to approve the repairs and retrofit of the porte-cochere with salvaged and new brick based on Wichita Falls Design Review Guidelines, Sec. 4; 3(a) and (b) - Sequence of Appropriate Treatment Options - Repair rather than replace deteriorated historic features and architectural elements whenever possible and if an original architectural feature has deteriorated beyond repair, the replacement shall match the historic feature in size, scale, profile and finish. Ms. Janel Ponder-Smith seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

VI. Action Item: Design Review – 711 Indiana Avenue (Landmark #36)

- Request to install new signage

Ms. Gagné presented the case and advised 711 Indiana Avenue was located just outside the Depot Square Historic District and was the last city landmark dedicated in 2016. The structure was previously Livery Stable and then used as a clothing store. Staff introduced photos from circa 1906 and 1909 which were used during the historic restoration in 2006.

The applicant has requested a wall sign placement/design by the Burn Shop. Placement of the 3 ft. X 7 ft. sign will be above the transom windows where there will be an air gap of 1.5-2 inches.

Ms. Gagné turned the floor over to the applicants, Ben Hoover and Grant Rogers for a presentation and any questions from the Commission.

Commission members stated they did not want the circle vent/architectural detail covered as it was a historical element. Christy Graham stated she wished to delay the approval of this case due to the fact it would be covering historic elements. Ms. Graham introduced a motion to not approve the sign proposal and request it be brought back for a new design consideration. Discussion continued and Ms. McKown noted that the Design Guidelines do not allow the same and/or similar design review application to be resubmitted within a 6mo window of a prior application. Ms. Graham rescinded her motion.

A legal point of order was made to postpone a determination on the signage request at 711 Indiana until the next Commission meeting and was considered unfinished business. The legal point of order received a motion of acceptance from Ms. Nadine McKown, seconded by Ms. Janel Ponder-Smith. Motion to postpone passed unanimously.

VII. Action Item: 2022 Landmark Commission Meeting Schedule & Application Deadlines

Ms. Nadine McKown introduced a motion to approve the 2022 Landmark Commission Meeting Schedule & Application Deadlines. Ms. Janel Ponder-Smith seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

VIII. Other Business:

a) Monthly Reports

Depot Square:

Ms. Derr gave downtown updates:

- Dec. – Farmer's Market open every Sat. to Dec. 18th
- Dec. 18th – City of Lights Reverse Parade 4-9pm
- Now – Dec. 18th – Wichita Theater – Annie, Grand 'Ol Christmas Show and Steel Magnolia's
- Now – Dec. 11th – Backdoor Theater – Winter Wonderettes
- Dec. 3rd & 4th – Wichita Ballet – Nutcracker
- Dec. 1st – 10th – Kell House – Santa House
- Dec. 18th – Kell House – Candlelight Tours
- Mi Fiesta Bazaar – open in old Value Village

West Floral Heights:

Ms. Ponder-Smith update:

- No news to report

b) Updates

- 1512 Tilden; CLG 4yr Eval Report; THC Statewide Preservation Plan Update

c) THC Real Places 2022 Conference – Feb. 2-4 (Austin)


d) Design Review – Staff Authorized – Minor Alteration/Repairs

- 408 Morningside (Morningside Historic District) – add carport rear yard – *Informational Only*
- 2703 9th St (Morningside Historic District) – roof top solar panels - *Informational Only*


IX. Adjourn

Meeting adjourned at 12:26 p.m.

Next regularly scheduled meeting January 25, 2021 - 12p.m.



Michele Derr, Chairperson



Date